

**REPUBLIC OF RWANDA**



**MINISTRY OF HEALTH**



Supply Chains <sup>4</sup> Community Case Management

**Rwanda Pathway to Supply Chain  
Sustainability Workshop  
25 April 2012**

**Workshop Results**

**Kigali April, 2012**

## ***Contents***

Introduction .....	3
Readiness Results.....	3
Supply Chain Integration.....	8
Parking Lot .....	12
Recommendations .....	12
Next Steps .....	14
Annex .....	15

## ***Introduction***

The Rwanda Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability Workshop was held at the Gorilla Hotel on April 25, 2012 with 23 participants, including 5 SC4CCM advisors. The complete participant list can be found at the end of this report. The goal of the workshop was to introduce the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability tool by using it to assess the readiness of implementing organizations to scale and institutionalize supply chain innovations for the community level and to identify actions needed to make those innovations standard practice. The goal, objectives and agenda can also be found at the end of this report. In addition, the overall supply chain for products for the community level was considered in relation to the characteristics of an integrated supply chain as a step towards sustainability. The following is a summary of the results of participant work on assessing readiness to scale and institutionalize supply chain innovations, and the discussion of the Rwanda supply chain for community level CCM products as an integrated supply chain. Please refer to the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability Tool for the complete readiness criteria. The results discussed are immediate next steps; several additional actions will be needed to achieve scale and institutionalization of the innovations.

As the innovation(s) to be scaled and institutionalized will be identified after the midline assessment, this workshop identified ways to improve the tool and began the discussion for preparedness for scaling up and institutionalization. The tool will be used again after midline and will more formally inform the innovation sustainability plan.

## ***Readiness Results***

At the time of the workshop in Rwanda, three CCM Supply chain interventions had been developed and rolled out in the pilot districts. The 3 interventions are; Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs, Quality Collaboratives for Supply Chain Improvement (QCs), and Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI)

During the workshop, participants were divided into three (3) groups to consider readiness to scale and institutionalize the supply chain innovations: one group looked at the Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs, the other looked at Quality Collaboratives for Supply Chain Improvement (QCs), and the third group looked at Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI). After some discussion the group defined the scope of scale-up for all three innovations as national.

The score indicates level of readiness – with fully ready and implementing being a score of 5 for Supply Chain Innovation at Scale, and a score of 3 for Institutionalization as a Standard Business Practice. The actions are initial activities that participants thought would be required to be better prepared for scale-up and institutionalization. The times provided by the participants are illustrative and will adjust once the innovations to scale are determined.

The results below indicate the level of readiness for Scalability and Institutionalization for the Intervention on **Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs.**

<b>Supply Chain Innovation at Scale</b>				
<b>Intervention: Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Coordination for Scale-Up	<b>4</b>	Distribution of Tools for Cell coordinators (CCs)	MOH/CHD	July 2012
		Training of TOTs at district level	CHD/Partners/Districts	July 2012
2. Organizational Capacity for Scale-Up	<b>3</b>	Set up/agree on indicators to monitor use, efficiency and impact of the Resupply tools and SOPS	MOH/CHD/Districts/Partners	June 2012
3. Funding/ Resources for Scale-Up	<b>3</b>	Secure additional funding for training and supervision	MOF/MOH	July 2012
4. Community/ Staff Prepared for Scale-Up	<b>4</b>	Conduct TOT for trainers on innovation	CHD/Partners	July 2012
5. Tools/ Technology for Scale-Up	<b>3</b>	Dissemination of tools	MOH-CHD/Partners	July 2012

<b>Institutionalization of New Supply Chain Practice as Standard Business Practice</b>				
<b>Intervention: Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Placement & Coordination	<b>1</b>	Develop a transition plan Identify key responsible persons to manage transition	MOH/CHD/Districts MOH/CHD/Districts	June 2012
2. Organizational Capacity	<b>1</b>	Integrate innovation into CHD work plan, performance management and information systems	CHD	July 2012
3. Funding Stability	<b>1</b>	Include in FY2012/13 budget	CHD	July 2012
4. Staff Capacity	<b>1</b>	Update JD / roles & responsibilities of staff to include innovation related activities	CHD/Districts	June 2012
5. Tools and Technological Infrastructure	<b>2</b>	Plan for the dissemination of tools	CHD	July 2012

The results below indicate the level of readiness for Scalability and Institutionalization for the Intervention on **Quality Collaboratives for Supply Chain Improvement (QCs)**.

<b>Supply Chain Innovation at Scale</b>				
<b>Intervention: Quality Collaboratives for Supply Chain Improvement (QCs)</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Coordination for Scale-Up	2	Establish coordination committee to identify roles and responsibilities and establish communications mechanisms	CHD	June 2012
2. Organizational Capacity for Scale-Up	1	Elaborate plan for scale-up	CHD & Partners	Sept 2012
		Establish management systems	CHD & Partners	Sept 2012
3. Funding & Resources for Scale-Up	1	Budget and mobilize funds	CHD	Nov 2012
4. Local Stakeholders prepared for scale-up	1	Hold orientation meetings by province for district staff	CHD & Partners	June 2013
5. Tools & Technology	1	Revise and produce tools for other districts	CHD & CCM partners	July 2013

<b>Institutionalization of New Supply Chain Practice as Standard Business Practice</b>				
<b>Intervention: Quality Collaboratives for Supply Chain Improvement (QCs)</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Placement & Coordination	1	Assign responsibility to existing unit or create another unit to manage QC activities (Managing Unit)	MCH	Sept 2013
2. Organizational Capacity	1	Managing Unit elaborates work plan which includes innovation as standard practice	Managing Unit (within MCH)	Dec 2013
		Establish management information system	MCH HMIS	Dec 2013
3. Funding Stability	1	Include budget for QCs in MCH budget	MCH & Partners	July 2013
4. Staff Capacity	1	Plan refresher training	MCH & Partners	Dec 2013
		Assign staff in charge of QCs	MCH	Sept 2013
5. Tools & Technological Infrastructure	1	Assign responsibility to staff for maintenance and distribution of tools  Plan mechanism for distribution of tools	MCH & MPPD	Sept 2013

The results below indicate the level of readiness for Scalability and Institutionalization for the Intervention on **Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI)**.

<b>Supply Chain Innovation at Scale</b>				
<b>Intervention: Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI)</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Coordination for Scale-Up	1	Assign responsibility to specific organization for scale up	MOH	June 2013
		Identify implementing partners for scale-up	MOH & Implementing Partners (IP)	June 2012
2. Organizational Capacity for Scale-Up	1	Develop tools and document plans for scale-up	MOH, JSI, IP	June 2013
		Establish management system for scale-up	MOH, JSI, IP	June 2013
		Establish partners management system	MOH	June 2013

<b>Supply Chain Innovation at Scale</b>				
<b>Intervention: Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI)</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
3. Funding & Resources for Scale-Up	1	Develop budget for scale-up	MOH, IP	June 2013
4. Local Stakeholders prepared for scale-up	1	Sensitize local stakeholders for scale-up	MOH	June 2013
5. Tools & Technology	1	Revise tools and adapt for scale-up	MOH, IPs, JSI	May 2013

<b>Institutionalization of New Supply Chain Practice as Standard Business Practice</b>				
<b>Intervention: Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI)</b>				
<b>Factor</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
1. Organizational Placement & Coordination	1	Develop plan for transitioning from scale-up roles & responsibilities to organizational roles & responsibilities for long term management of innovation	MOH, IPs	By 2014
2. Organizational Capacity	1	Include innovation in work plan	MOH, IPs	By 2014
		Include innovation in information system	MOH, IPs	By 2014
		Include innovations in performance management P.M.S.	MOH	By 2014
		Align innovations with goal of larger organization	MOH	By 2013
3. Funding Stability	1	Include innovation in the budget	MOH, IPs	June 2013
4. Staff Capacity	1	Integrate innovation as a standard business practice	MOH, Districts	June 2013
5. Tools & Technological Infrastructure	1	Develop procurement plan for tools and technology	MOH	June 2013

## **Supply Chain Integration**

The process followed for this section of the workshop was to identify through group discussion which of the statements under each characteristic for an integrated supply chain were true and which were false for the Rwandan context. The large group discussion focused on one or two statements which were rated false with a view to identifying actions that could address the statement and move towards making the statement true.

### **A. Clarity of Roles and Responsibilities**

1. Supply chain leadership exists, empowered to manage change as needed.
2. There is adequate staff to achieve the goals of the supply chain organization.
3. Supply chain roles and responsibilities of staff are clearly defined, documented and visible to all parties in the supply chain.
4. The supply chain organization has defined the roles and responsibilities for all stakeholders in meeting its goals.
5. Supply chain staff has the skills needed to perform their roles and responsibilities.
6. Supply chain training is available to staff as needed to perform their roles.
7. There is a process to assess staff performance and take action to improve staff performance.
8. Staff has incentives to implement the supply chain roles and responsibilities.

### **Notes from Discussion:**

*The teams said that most statements were true specifically No. 1-5. Statement 6-8 were said to be false for the supply chain system in Rwanda. The staff has incentives to implement the supply chain was identified as one of the false statements with the teams feeling that incentives for SC are not available at all levels of the system like those related to clinical care. Supply chain training is available to staff as needed to perform their roles- was also found to be false due to attrition rates and the ever changing or evolving technologies that require continuous updating of staff .*

### **Challenges:**

1. *Incentivizing everyone is difficult since this is linked to availability of funds*
2. *The importance of SC is not highly ranked or recognized within the MOH programs/units*
3. *Staff attrition rates and staff turnover impact on training*

### **Actions:**

1. *Review where Supply chain as a function/unit sits within the organizational structure of the MOH. The higher up it is the more authority it has. Remember SC is cross-functional. If MOH units and programs recognize SC as an important function staff working in SC will be more motivated to do the job.*
2. *Visibility of data-MOH policy makers need to see the relationship between the health indicators of the population and supply chain activities. Availability of data that links e.g. stock status to*



*disease burden, and presentation of this data to decision makers at various levels would reinforce/explain the importance of supply chain.*

- 3. Introduce PBF in the supply chain system. In other clinical areas PBF is a motivator. People would rather work in clinical areas than in SC where there are no incentives.*
- 4. Need to have a skills acquisition and performance improvement plan in place to support training of staff.*

## **B. Agility**

1. Supply chain processes are performed quickly, accurately, and effectively so products, information and decisions can move swiftly through the supply chain to respond promptly to customer needs.
2. Supply chain managers efficiently manage staff and resources.
3. The supply chain organization responds rapidly to changes in the environment, the marketplace, and customer needs.
4. The supply chain organization self-assesses, learns from mistakes, and adapts through a continuous improvement process.

### **Notes from Discussion:**

*Statement no. 1 was rated false by all. Statement no. 2 was rated false by some and true by others. All others were rated true.*

*Movement of supply chain information from lower levels upwards through the system is slow and data is not always visible. This affects the level of responsiveness within the supply chain.*

*Question on statement 2- Do supply chain managers really manage staff & resources efficiently?? Some feel we should evaluate efficiency in context so for example, if a manager is managing resources within his control efficiently, then he should not be penalized for what is outside his control. Those who felt the statement was false alluded to the fact that retention is a challenge that affects efficiency.*

### **Actions**

- 1. Improve data visibility and streamline the information flow process at all levels of the system to improve responsiveness.*
- 2. Set standards and criteria for measuring agility then bench mark to see where we are now- and what improvements need to be made to get to the standard. Then monitor progress and take corrective action in order to meet standards.*

## **C. Streamlined Processes**

1. Work processes (reporting, inventory management procedures, etc.) are documented and publicized throughout the supply chain.
2. There is adequate funding to support the supply chain activities from a variety of sources.

3. Organizational systems (human resources, financial, IT, communications, etc.) are in place to support supply chain needs.
4. The supply chain organization has a defined process for quality improvement.
5. The supply chain organization implements innovative new technologies as appropriate.
6. The supply chain organization has a review process for monitoring whether revisions are implemented and lead to improvements; staff comfort with changes is addressed.

**Notes from Discussion:**

*One group said that some statements 3 & 4 were work in progress while the other said that most statements were true. They identified Communication -publication of work processes throughout the Supply chain as challenge*

**Actions**

1. *Review and improve the ICT system in order to improve communication throughout the supply chain.*
2. *Institute a system to monitor quality. The recently established Logistics Management Office is seen as the entity that will play the role of ensuring the process for quality improvement monitoring is stream lined and agile.*

**D. Visibility of Information**

1. Supply chain data are visible throughout the supply chain to all stakeholders in a timely manner.
2. Supply chain managers use this information to better meet customer needs.

**Notes from Discussion:**

*One group said that both statements false while the other group said that the statements represent work in progress.*

**Challenges:**

1. *Data validity was expressed as one of the challenges experienced by those at national level. This affects trust as those at national level do not feel confident enough to use data from lower levels- felt to be inaccurate for making decisions on customer needs. e.g. MPDD may not trust consumption data as reported by districts and prefer to use issue data to make decisions on quantities to order.*
2. *Lack of data visibility- poor sharing of data due to information sitting at certain levels and not being easily accessible to all was also expressed as an indication of lack of trust.*

**Action:**

1. *Implement Monitoring and evaluation activities in the field to improve data accuracy*

## **E. Trust And Collaboration**

1. Managers, implementers, funders and community collaborate to achieve supply chain organization's goals and vision.
2. A collaborative environment exists that can help break down functional and organizational barriers to improve supply chain performance.
3. Supply chain managers are empowered to form teams to address issues to improve supply chain performance.
4. Supply chain partners trust each other.
5. Strategic planning is done in collaboration with partners and other units of the MOH.
6. The supply chain organization has political and advocacy support with the MOH, and from partners and stakeholders outside the MOH.
7. The supply chain organization has established mechanisms for routine communication within the MOH and with partners and stakeholders outside the MOH.

### **Notes from Discussion:**

*One group said that most statements were true except no 4 &7. Another group said that some statements may sound true at central level, but not at district or community level.*

*Trust level among partners was said to be low since there is poor trust for the information shared. Communication and coordination between stakeholders happens more and is better at the higher levels, but poor at the lower levels.*

### **Actions:**

1. *Establish routine mechanisms of coordination for all levels*
2. *Improve communication and coordination*

## **F. Alignment Of Objectives**

1. Supply chain managers have developed clear goals and a vision for the supply chain.
2. Supply chain managers effectively articulate the vision of the supply chain to external partners.
3. The supply chain organization's vision, mission and goals are aligned with the MOH and other supply chain partners.
4. The supply chain is well integrated into the operations of the MOH.

### **Notes from Discussion:**

*Generally consensus is that this is a work in progress. Statement No1- Goals & objectives exist but they are not necessarily aligned between levels.*

### **Actions:**

1. *Communication and coordination between MOH, partners and SC organization to align goals & objectives.*
2. *Hold periodic coordination meetings between stakeholders,*
3. *Develop a dissemination strategy to ensure that the mission and vision is shared to and known by all.*

### ***Parking Lot***

One item was entered into the “Parking Lot” during the workshop: *feasibility component*. One participant suggested that we consider the feasibility of implementing either of the innovations that are being tested. In response, it was stated that the SC4CCM Project would be budgeting the innovations and in light of available resources consider the feasibility of the innovations.

### ***Recommendations***

#### **1. Plan for and implement actions recommended in table “Supply Chain Innovation at Scale Intervention: Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs”**

Scale-up of standard resupply procedures for CHWs is already underway in Rwanda. The application of the tool to this innovation showed a readiness score of 17 out of 25 for Supply Chain Innovation at Scale. CHD should consider the actions identified by the group to further strengthen the scale-up activities. These actions included:

- Further TOTs for trainers at district level
- Distribution of tools for cell coordinators
- Securing additional funds for scale-up
- Agreeing to and setting up indicators to monitor use, efficiency and impact of the resupply tools and SOPS

Please see the table above for specific suggestions for timing of implementing these actions.

#### **2. Plan for and initiate steps to institutionalize the management of Standard Resupply Procedures for CHWs**

While the scale up of the standard resupply procedures for CHWs is being rolled out across the nation, CHD should implement steps to institutionalize the management of this activity within CHD as a standard business practice. As identified by the workshop group discussing standard resupply procedures, these steps include:

- Develop a transition plan for management of the standard resupply procedures from scale-up responsibilities to institutional responsibility
- Identify key responsible persons to manage transition

- Integrate management of standard resupply procedures (further training, productions of tools, etc.) into CHD work plan, performance management and information systems
- Include activities related to standard resupply procedures in FY2012/13 budget
- Update job descriptions and roles & responsibilities of staff (CHWs, cell coordinators, HC staff, trainers, etc.) to include standard resupply procedures related activities
- Plan for the dissemination of standard resupply procedures tools as needed.

Please see the table above for specific suggestions for timing of implementing these actions.

### **3. Begin planning for scale-up of supply chain innovations.**

Even though the additional supply chain innovations to be taken to scale have not yet been determined, actions can be taken to better prepare for scale-up of the chosen innovation. In preparing in advance for scale-up, MCH and CHD should:

- Identify the organizational entity which will be responsible for the scale-up of the innovation and identify potential implementing partners who could support scale-up
- Identify and plan for possible changes to or adaptation of management systems (information, financial, performance management, etc.) to include requirements for the innovation
- Begin to advocate for and identify funds to support scale up

### **4. Plan for further application of the *Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability* tool after determination of the innovations to scale as a result of the midline assessment and agreement of MOH.**

The primary goals of using the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability tool in the workshop were to introduce the tool and receive feedback on it, and to initiate thinking about the actions that would be needed to scale up the innovations if they are proven successful. After the mid-line assessment, when the innovation to be taken to scale is chosen, the MOH, SC4CCM and other partners should use the tool to assist them to assess readiness to scale and institutionalize the innovation and to develop a specific scale up and institutionalization plan. If possible the tool should be used in a similar workshop format, ensuring the following:

- Decision makers such as program managers participate in the workshop. To encourage participation, individual meetings with key decision makers in advance of the workshop should be scheduled to introduce the purpose of the workshop, discuss the significance of the potential outcomes, and emphasize the importance of their participation.
- Additional time should be added to the workshop schedule to fully consider the factors and actions needed so that the outcome of the workshop is a detailed for scale-up agreed to by all participants. To accomplish this it is suggested that the workshop should take no less than two days.

## ***Next Steps***

1. Brief relevant participants unable to attend the workshop on the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability Workshop, tool, results and recommendations.
2. Implement recommendations as agreed to.

## Annex

### Workshop Participants

S/N	NAMES	INSTITUTIONS	POSITION	TELEPHONE	EMAIL
1	Ntirenganya Lazare	Rutsiro DP	Pharmacist	0788771663	ntirenganyal@yahoo.fr
2	Uwizeye M William	JSI/SCMS	Data Analyst	0788300796	wuwizeye@gmail.com
3	Sarah Cohen	IRC	Health Coord.	0788305696	Sarah.cohen@rescue.org
4	Murekatete Douceline	JSI/SCMS	Data Analyst	0788381179	doucemureka@yahoo.fr
5	Ngizwenayo Elias	PIH/IMB	C.H. Coord.	0788345056	elinginayo@yahoo.fr
6	Joseph Mushinzimana	Burera DP	Pharmacist	0788850326	josemuob@gmail.com
7	Rwabukera Fidele	RBC/MPDD	DO	0788307260	frwabukera@yahoo.fr
8	Mbombo Wathum P	MSH/SIAPS	SPA	0788867025	mwathum@msh.org
9	Wane Ngenzi Olivier	MOH/MCH/CHD	Pharmacist	0788358649	oligen2006@yahoo.fr
10	Innocent Maniraho	CWR	C. Health Officer	0788831462	innomana@yahoo.fr
11	Fiacre Rutaganda	Ngoma District	DP Director	0783056700	fiacrut@yahoo.fr
12	Prince Rwaburindi	Shyira District	CHW'S Supervisor	0788751750	rwabuprince@yahoo.fr
13	Dr. Denise Ilibagiza	UNICEF	Health officer	0788428494	dilibagiza@unicef.org
14	Ndahayo Oscar	Burera District	CHW Supervisor	0788894643	ndoscart@yahoo.fr
15	Claire Nazin	PIH/IMB	CHD POPN MGR	0784870241	cnazin@phi.org
16	Ngabo Nathalie	MOH Malaria	Logistics officer	0788526178	ngabo_nathalie@yahoo.fr
17	Mugirasoni Joyce	JSI/SC4CCM	FAM	0788853375	jmugirasoni@jsi.org.rw
18	Mildred Shieshia	JSI/SC4CCM	Reg. Tech Advisor	+254725855762	mildred_sheishia@jsi.com
19	Deogratias Leopold	JSI/SC4CCM	LA	0788486509	delrw@yahoo.com
20	Barbara Felling	JSI/SC4CCM	Inst dev advisor	+1-703-310-5061	barbara@jsi.com
21	Golbert Kazoza	JSI/SC4CCM	LO	0788402078	gkazoza@jsi.org.rw
22	Patrick Nganji	JSI/SC4CCM	RLA	0788357656	pnganji@jsi.org.rw

## Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability Workshop (25 April 2012): Goals, Objectives and Agenda

### Goal:

The goal of this workshop is to introduce the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability tool by using it to assess the readiness of implementing organizations to scale and institutionalize supply chain innovations for community case management and to identify actions needed to make those innovations standard practice.

### Objectives:

1. Obtain feedback on the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability tool and process
2. Describe the purpose and format of the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability Tool
3. Define the terms scalability, institutionalization and integrated supply chain
4. Define the scope of scale up for CCM supply chain innovations
5. Use the Pathway to Supply Chain Sustainability tool to identify factors that need to be developed or strengthened to scale and institutionalize supply chain innovations
6. Identify specific actions to take to plan to scale and institutionalize supply chain innovations
7. Begin to identify ways to transform the current supply chain into an integrated, sustainable supply chain

### Agenda:

9:00 – 9:30	Introduction to the Workshop
9:30 – 10:00	Review of Supply Chain Innovations/Introduction to the Tool
10:00 – 11:00	Application of the Tool & Planning: Supply Chain Innovation at Scale
11:00 – 11:15	Break
11:15 – 11:45	Application of the Tool & Planning: Supply Chain Innovation at Scale (cont.)
11:45 – 12:30	Application of the Tool & Planning: Institutionalization of New Supply Chain Practice as Standard Business Practice
12:30 – 1:30	Lunch
1:30 – 2:00	Application of the Tool & Planning: Institutionalization of New Supply Chain Practice as Standard Business Practice (cont.)
2:00 – 2:30	What is a sustainable supply chain?



2:30 – 3:00	Understanding Integrated Supply Chains
3:00 – 3:30	Sustaining the Community Supply Chain in Rwanda
3:30 – 3:45	Break
3:45 – 4:15	Sustaining the Community Supply Chain in Rwanda
4:15 – 5:00	Feedback on Tool
5:00 – 5:30	Next Steps and Wrap-Up